**Rabbi Sedley Halacha**  
Shabbat Laws - Melachot  
**SHIUR 6**  
Rabbi David Sedley

---

**Talmud Bavli Shabbat 74a**  
It was taught in a Baraisa: If someone had in front of them two kinds of food - they may separate and eat, separate and leave, but they may not separate, and if they separated they are chayav a chatat.

What does this mean? Ula said, this is what it means. ‘separate and eat’, for immediate consumption, ‘separate and leave’, for the same day. But for the next day should not separate, and if they did, chayav chatat.

**Tosefta Shabbat ch. 16**  
If fruits became mixed with other fruits, one may separate and eat, separate and place on the table, or separate and place before an animal. If someone separated out the two fruits, or gathered up the dirt and pebbles from them they are chayav.

**Tosefot Shabbat 74a**  
If there were two kinds of foods ... Rabbainu Chananel explained that separating food from food is also breira, if someone separates the one they don't want from the one they want. The one that they don't want is considered *p'solet* (rubbish) compared with the one that they want to eat.

**Shulchan Aruch Orech Chaim 321**  
It is forbidden to peel garlic or onions if peeling for later. But to eat straight away is permitted.

**Mishna Brura (83)**  
to peel - because of borer.

---

you can find more shabbat source sheets on the web:  
www.rabbisedley.com
Biur Halacha 321 ‘to peel’
One could ask that since peeling is included in borer, it should be forbidden even for immediate consumption since one who peels apples, garlic or onions, removes the p’solet and leaves the ochel. It seems that the explanation is that since it is impossible to eat in any other way, this is considered the normal way of eating (derech achila), and is therefore not considered removing p’solet from ochel, rather eating the inside, and provided it is for immediate consumption that is permitted, but to leave for later is forbidden, because it is not better than a normal case of removing ochel from p’solet.

Mishna Brura 321; 84
Onion and garlic - the same is true of apples, almonds, nuts and anything else like that. If a person opens a plum and throws out the stone, with intention to leave the fruit for later, that is borer.

Mishna Brura 319 (61)
If a fly or something else falls into food or drink it is forbidden to remove the fly either by hand or with a utensil, since that is separating p’solet from ochel. Rather one must take a bit of the food or the drink out with it and throw it away.

Shulchan Aruch Oreich Chaim 319
[Rama] Anything that is separated for the meal that one is sitting down to straight away is called immediately... Even if others are eating with them it is permitted. Therefore it is permitted to separate as many lettuce leaves as are needed for that meal.

you can find more shabbat source sheets on the web:
www.rabbisedley.com
Mishna Brura 319: 6
Even for others - meaning that someone may separate for all the people who are eating with them, and this is not considered breira, since it is the normal way of eating, and even if the person is not eating with the others at all it is still permitted. When the Rama wrote ‘with them’ he didn’t mean it literally.

Biur Halacha 319
Many of the Acharonim, including the Magen Avraham, who hold that regarding two kinds of food the laws of borer are slightly different than separating ochel from p’solet, in that it is only considered for later if one separates for the next meal. In other words, someone who has finished their meal and then separates for the next meal, even though it is quite a while later, nevertheless that is still considered ‘immediate’. But one should be very careful (and not follow this ruling) since it could easily become a Torah prohibition.

Mishna Brura 319: 66
You should know that the tosefta says one may separate a cooked food. What this means is that separating solid food from the gravy with a spoon is permitted, since this is the normal way of eating.
Rabbi Sedley
Shabbat Laws - Melachot
SHIUR 6
Rabbi David Sedley

Rabbi Sedley Halacha

Shiur 6

you can find more shabbat source sheets on the web:
www.rabbisedley.com